



COPYRIGHT LAW REVIEW COMMITTEE

Report on Moral Rights

January 1988

Attorney-General's Department

COPYRIGHT LAW REVIEW COMMITTEE

Report on Moral Rights

January 1988

Australian Government Publishing Service
Canberra

@ Commonwealth of Australia 1988
ISBN 0 644 07682 8

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part may be reproduced by any process without written permission from the Director Publishing and Marketing AGPS. Inquiries should be directed to the Manager, AGPS Press, Australian Government Publishing Service, G.P.O. Box 84, Canberra, A.C.T. 2601.

Time constraints determined by the author department prevented AGPS editorial and design input into this work.

Printed in Australia by R. D. RUBIE, Commonwealth Government Printer, Canberra

PREFACE

The Copyright Law Review Committee was established in 1983 to consider and report to the Attorney-General on specific copyright matters referred to it from time to time.

The Committee presently consists of the Chairman, Mr Justice I.F. Sheppard, President of the Copyright Tribunal, Mr Peter Banki, Solicitor, Phillips Fox, Mr Brett Cottle, Managing Director, Australian Mechanical Copyright Owners Society, Mr Derek Fielding, University of Queensland Librarian, Mr Michael Frankel, Solicitor, Michael Frankel and Co. Solicitors, Mr Ian Govey, Attorney-General's Department, Professor Dennis Pearce, Australian National University, Mr Bob Rodgers, Superintendent Audio-visual, Western Australian Department of Education and Mr David Walsh, Solicitor, Mallesons Stephen Jaques. Members of the Committee were appointed in their personal capacity, having regard to their background, to ensure a balance of relevant interests.

The Committee has been asked to consider six references and has now completed and forwarded to the Attorney-General its report on four of these. As well as this report on moral rights, the Committee has completed references on performers' Protection, the meaning of publication in the Copyright Act and church use of copyright materials. The outstanding references on which the Committee is presently working are the importation provisions of the Copyr ight Act which enable a copyright owner to control the importation of both legitimately made and pirate copies of copyright materials and the remedy of conversion damages provided for in section 116 of the Act.

Enquiries concerning, the Committee's work should be directed to:

Mr Peter Treyde
Secretary
Copyright Law Review Committee
Attorney-General's Department
Robert Garran Offices
National Circuit
CANBERRA ACT 2600

Telephone (062) 71 9609

Report on Moral Rights

Contents

	PAGE	
1. Terms of Reference	1	
2. Recommendations	1	
3. Course of the Inquiry	2	
4. Nature of Moral Rights	2	
PART II		MAJORITY VIEWS
1. The Present Australian Legal Position	6	
2. Summary of Reasons for Recommendations	10	
3. Practical Considerations	11	
(a) attribution	11	
(b) integrity	14	
4. Theoretical Basis for Moral Rights	18	
5. Support for Introduction of Moral Rights	20	
6. Infractions of Moral Rights	2	2
7. Australian Community's Perception of Moral Rights	27	
8. Actions by Authors.	29	

PART III	MINORITY VIEWS	PAGE
1.	Introduction	31
2.	The minority's Recommendations and its Short Reasons Therefor	35
3.	The minority's General Consideration of the Reference	39
A.	The Doctrine of the Moral Right	39
	(i) The Right of Disclosure	42
	(ii) The Right of Withdrawal	43
	(iii) The Right of Attribution	43
	(iv) The Right of Integrity of the Artistic Creation	44
	(v) Alienability	47
	(vi) Duration	48
	(vii) Exercise after the Death of the Creator	49
B.	The Case for Moral Rights Legislation	49
	(i) Australia's Obligations under the Berne Convention	50
	(ii) The United Kingdom and Canadian Developments	52
	(iii) The Rest of the World	54
	(iv) Public Remand	54
	(v) The 'Moral' Argument	56
	(vi) Technological Change	58

PART III	MINORITY VIEWS CONTINUED	PAGE
C.	The Case Against Moral Rights Legislation and the minority's Treatment of that Case	61
	(i) The requirements of the Berne Convention are already sufficiently protected	62
	(ii) Moral Rights as a Concept is alien to Australia's Property-Based Legal System	74
	(iii) Moral Rights are not compatible with the <u>Copyright Act</u>	75
	(iv) There is no compelling demand, nor need for moral rights legislation	77
	(v) The Practical Difficulties Associated with the Implementation of Moral Rights are too Great	86
	(vi) Moral Rights would stifle Criticism in the Form of Parody and Burlesque	96
	(vii) Moral Rights Legislation in Australia would Complicate Australian Dealings with Other Countries where there is no Moral Rights Legislation	97
4.	Conclusions	98

PART IV	ENDNOTES AND APPENDICES	
	Endnotes Majority Views	110
	Endnotes Minority Views	1 1 2
	Appendix 1 - List of submitters responding to Committee's discussion paper.	125

Appendix 2 - List **of** submitters
responding to Committee's request
for comments from government
authorities, publishers and postcard
manufacturers. 127

Appendix 3 - Part IX of the
Copyright Act 1968. 128